

UNITED FORUM OF EXECUTIVES ASSOCIATIONS  
COMPRISING (AIBSNLEA & AIGETOA)  
CHQ, New Delhi

No:UF/CMD/DGM Rectt. /15-16

Dated the 1<sup>st</sup> Oct- 2015

To

The CMD  
BSNL,  
New Delhi - 110001

**Subject: Framing of direct DGM RR with intention to recruit inferior candidates from targeted group and completely debarring the internal candidates possessing all the qualification, talent and experience at higher side – our submission for thorough examination and investigation regarding.**

Respected Sir,

At the outset Forum of AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA is highly thankful for recognizing the resentment and voice of internal executives facing gross injustice and discrimination in direct DGM recruitment in BSNL and putting recruitment process on hold. We are also thankful for granting meeting to the forum with Director (HR) on this very critical issue on 23-09-2015 wherein after having detail discussion, it is appreciated that some vital steps have been lapsed by recruitment wing in handling the recruitment process of DGMs and the issue of RRs not coming favorably for internal candidates needs to be thoroughly examined. On behalf of the forum of executives association comprising of AIBSNLEA and AIGETOA, we are hereby submitting following facts for necessary examination and investigation in the matter-

**Power of the employer and aim of the recruitments:**

It is beyond doubt that the BSNL, in order to maintain excellence in its operations can choose its own policy of recruitment for absorbing efficient personnel to face the increasing competition from the private sector. Court of law has also observed that ***It is for the employer to prescribe the eligibility criteria and the competence of the employer cannot be questioned so long as the criteria prescribed is uniform and with the object of absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization.***

**Concern of the forum in direct DGM recruitment in BSNL:**

Without questioning the power of the employer to make recruitment at any level, being stake holder and directly affected party, forum is hereby raising the serious objection on the intend of the said recruitment which is not only disfavoring the internal talents but also not at all intended for absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization. It is completely the planned move to recruit from some targeted group of inferior candidates and deliberately debarring more qualified, talented, efficient and experienced internal candidates.

**Facts and observation of the forum in respect of DGM recruitment in BSNL need to be examined and investigated:**

Forum is hereby submitting some facts and observations on direct DGM recruitment which clearly reveal that DGM recruitment is not only disfavoring the internal candidates but also not at all intended of absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization.

1. DGM post in BSNL has been 100% promotional post for internal candidates recruited in feeder cadre. BSNL has already recruited professionally qualified Graduate Engineer and Account officers at feeder level of executives in the field of Telecom Operation and Finance respectively. There was absolutely no need for direct DGM recruitment from outside in these fields ignoring the facts that there are thousands of candidates available within BSNL with required qualification and experience.
2. There are already about 1300 sectioned DGM post in Telecom Operation and about 400 DGM post in Telecom Finance out of which more than 70% post remain still unfilled despite number of executives are eligible to be promoted to DGM. It is beyond understanding the need to create 200 additional DGM posts for direct recruitment in the same field? At present more than 2000 regular DEs are available to fill-up all the vacant DGM posts but one or the other pretext these DGM vacancies are not being filled-up from eligible DEs.
3. As per the Recruitment Rule for direct recruitment of DGM against these 200 posts following eligibility criteria is prescribed.  
**Candidates possessing the prescribed qualification from public sector, private sector and government are eligible to apply. All candidates, however, must fulfill all three criteria mentioned below:-**
  - (i) **Twelve (12) years of post qualification working experience,**
  - (ii) **Minimum of 3 years of experience in-**
    - (a) **E-4 grade as defined in DPE guidelines (IDA pre-revised scale Rs. 14500-350-18700/ Revised IDA Scale Rs. 29100-54500) in case of PSU experience or**
    - (b) **Equivalent annual gross salary, which comes to approximately Rs. Seven Lacs gross, in case of private sector or**
    - (c) **CDA scale Rs. 10000-325-15200 (pre-revised scale in case of government posts).****Minimum work experience of 5 years in a company with an annual turnover more than Rs. 100 Cr. (in case of PSU, Private Companies).**
4. From the above eligibility criteria it is very much evident that candidates from PSU and Government Department possessing the required qualification (BE/BTech/CA/ICWA etc) and length of service (12 years) need to fulfill additional criteria of working at particular level (3 years at E4 in case of PSU and pre-revised CDA scale Rs. 10000-325-15200 in case of Government Department) but candidates working in private sectors possessing required qualification and length of service are eligible irrespective of their level of working if their gross annual income is approx 7 lacs. In other words candidates from PSU and Government Department possessing all the qualification and length of service as of private candidates are not eligible for DGM post even if their gross salary is more than Rs 7 lacs.
5. Initial pay scale offered to the direct DGM in BSNL is Rs. 32900/- and hence annual package comes around Rs 8 Lakhs. Almost all schedule-A category PSU recruits Graduate Engineers and Account Professionals at E3 (Rs 24900-) pay scale and promotes them to next grades in every 3-4 years hence in 12 years of service they must have been promoted to E5 and E6 pay scale. Candidates from even Schedule-D category PSU and Government Department satisfying above eligibility criteria have already crossed the basic pay of Rs 32900/- on account their promotions and one pay revision. Most of the CPSEs and Government Department pays perks/allowance, superannuation benefits and PRP which are much more than BSNL. In other words professionally qualified candidates appointed in any PSU and in any Government Departments after having 12 years of post qualification experience with 3 years in the mentioned scales would have crossed the basic pay of DGM in BSNL functionally well as financially and would have been receiving more gross salary than the gross salary offered for DGM in BSNL.

*S. S. S.*

6. The preference of the Brilliant and talented professionals are either Administrative Services or high profile private companies/MNCs or Public Sectors or Government Department. Candidates from CPSE and Government Department would not prefer to apply for DGM post in BSNL due to the reason mentioned above in para-5. High profile Private companies/MNCs recruit candidates through campus selection and offers initial package of more than Rs 7 lacs to brilliant and talented fresh Engineering Graduate and CA/ICWA candidates hence on getting experience of 12 years their package would be more than Rs. 25 Lakhs.
7. It is very much clear from the above observations mentioned in para-6 and 7 above that with the prescribed eligibility criteria, no candidates from CPSEs, Government Department and brilliant/talented candidates from High Profile Privet Companies /MNCs would prefer to apply for DGM post in BSNL. Internal candidates of BSNL possessing prescribed qualification and experience as of private candidates are made ineligible forever by inserting the criteria of 3 years working experience in E4 scale because no internal candidates of BSNL is reaching to E4 in 9 years in existing policy and by the time internal candidates will reach to 3 years on E4 pay scale they will cross the age 45 years which is upper age limit for direct DGM in BSNL.
8. ***With the above observation, only candidates left for DGM post in BSNL are those who are not able to secure job in any CPSEs, Government Department and High Profile Private Companies /MNCs through campus selection and hence working with some small vendors with last five years in registered company having turnover of merely Rs 100 Cr.*** There are many senior officers (working/retire) in BSNL running such companies in the name of the family or relatives, many such vendors are also associated with BSNL. It cannot be ruled out their involvement for the proposed DGM recruitment for awarding experience certificate to such candidates who could not secure any job after completion of their professional study.
9. Out of more than 230 CPSEs, BSNL is biggest CPSE in volume and having pan India presence. It is only BSNL where professionally qualified candidates recruited at executive's level for the post of JTO/JAO handle independent managerial as well as operational function in sub-divisions. There are no any Government Organization, CPSE and Private Company like BSNL where fresh appointed JTO/JAO performs all the managerial as well as operational function in sub-divisions independently. There is no substitute of the internal candidates possessing all the qualification and having vast experience in BSNL itself for the post of DGM in BSNL. There is no HR practice in the world which gives preferential treatment to outsiders and completely debar the internal candidates despite they possess all the qualification and experience at higher side. All such basic HR practice is deliberately ignored while framing the DGM RR so that some inferior candidates from targeted small private companies can be inducted as DGM which clearly reveals some vested interest.
10. It is ample clear from the above analysis that keeping vacant the existing sanctioned post of DGMs despite number of eligible and experience internal candidates, creating additional 200 post for direct recruitment without any justification, framing targeted recruitment rule to keep out the talented candidates from PSUs, Government Departments and High Profile Private companies/MNCs, completely debarring the internal candidates possessing all the qualification and length of service at higher side as of private candidates is not at all intended to recruit more talented and efficient candidates for the post of DGM. Graduate Engineer and Account professional of BSNL who are already recruited through toughest All India Competition and performing all the managerial and operational function in Telecom Operation and Finance are completely undermined and deliberately made ineligible but a candidates who are not able to secure job in any CPSE, Government Department and in High Profile Private Sectors/MNCs and working with some small private sectors are only



offered the post of DGM in BSNL. The inferiority of the external candidates are also visible by the result of written exam where only 50 candidates qualified against 106 notified vacancies in Telecom Operation and 9 candidates qualified against 56 notified vacancies in Telecom Finance. The Declaration of result for internal candidates will establish the talent of internal candidates at the same time it will also expose the vested interest in BSNL management in DGM recruitment.


Dated the 1<sup>st</sup> Oct. 2015


11. The present DGM RR and DGM recruitment is in no way for **absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization but certainly for some other purpose**. Being stake holder and directly affected party forum has every right to object such decision of BSNL board which is not only harming the interest of the internal executives but equally harming the growth of the company.

You are kindly requested to examine the DGM recruitment in BSNL keeping the above submission in mind and go through all the justification given by concern cell for DGM recruitment, Management committee note and board memo etc. which will certainly provide some more facts.

Sincerely yours

Respected Sir,

  
(PRAHLAD RAI)  
GS, AIBSNLEA

  
for  
(R.P. Shahu)  
GS, AIGETOA

Copy to:

1. The Director (HR), BSNL Board, New Delhi
2. The GM (Pers/Rectt), BSNL CO, New Delhi

Power of the employer and aim of the recruitment:

It is beyond doubt that the BSNL, in order to maintain excellence in its operations can choose its own policy of recruitment for absorbing efficient personnel to face the increasing competition from the private sector. Court of law has also observed that it is for the employer to prescribe the eligibility criteria and the competence of the employer cannot be questioned so long as the criteria prescribed is uniform and with the object of absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization.

Content of the forum in direct DGM recruitment in BSNL:

Without questioning the power of the employer to make recruitment at any level, being stake holder and directly affected party, forum is hereby raising the serious objection on the intent of the said recruitment which is not only disfavoring the internal talents but also not at all intended for absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization. It is completely the planned move to recruit from some targeted group of inferior candidates and deliberately neglecting more qualified, talented, efficient and experienced internal candidates.

Facts and observation of the forum in respect of DGM recruitment in BSNL need to be examined and investigated:

Forum is hereby submitting some facts and observations on direct DGM recruitment which clearly reveal that DGM recruitment is not only disfavoring the internal candidates but also not at all intended of absorbing more efficient and talented people for effective functioning of the organization.